EXHIBIT C

LOUISE GOLDSTON GIBSON V GOLDSTON

March 01, 2022 1-4

GIBSON V GOLDS I ON		1-4
Page 1 1 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE 2 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA	1 EXAMINATION INDEX	Page 3
3 AT BECKLEY 4	3 BY MR. BRYAN 6	
**************************************	5	
MATTHEW GIBSON,	6	
6 Digintiff	EXHIBIT INDEX	
Plaintiff, 7	7	
vs. CIVIL ACTION NO.	8 Exhibit 1 Louise Goldston Judicial 6 Disciplinary Proceeding	
8 5:21-cv-00181 LOUISE E. GOLDSTON, Individually,	9	
9 COUNTY COMMISSION OF RALEIGH	Exhibit 2 Public Admonishment of the 23	
COUNTY, a political subdivision, 10 JEFF MCPEAKE, Individually,	10 Honorable Eric Shuck, Judge of the	
BRIAN WHITE, Individually,	13th Family Court Circuit	
11 BOBBY STUMP, Individually,	Exhibit 3 Louise Goldston Judicial 43	
KYLE LUSK, Individually, 12	12 Disciplinary Counsel Agreement	
Defendants.	13 Exhibit 4 Formal Statement of Charges 44	
13	14 Exhibit 5 Transcript of Judicial Board 56	
14	Hearing of Louise Goldston dated 15 January 15, 2021	
15 16 Deposition of LOUISE E. GOLDSTON taken by	16 Exhibit 6 Audio Recording Recorded by 65	
16 Deposition of LOUISE E. GOLDSTON taken by the Plaintiff under the Federal Rules of Civil	Plaintiff Matthew Gibson	
17 Procedure in the above-entitled action, pursuant to	17	
notice, before Bradford L. Cooper, a Notary Public, 18 at Pullin, Fowler, Flanagan, Brown, and Poe, PLLC,	Exhibit 7 Video of the Incident at the Home 82	
252 George Street, Beckley, West Virginia, on the	18 of Matthew Gibson 19 Exhibit 8 Divorce Hearing Video dated April 84	
19 1st day of March, 2022. 20	19, 2018	
21 REALTIME REPORTERS, a Huseby Company	20	
BRADFORD L. (Brad) COOPER, Notary Public 22 713 Lee Street	Exhibit 9 Recording of Kyle Lusk at Hearing 90	
Charleston, WV 25301	21 re: Search	
23 (304) 344-8463	22 Exhibit 10 Voicemail Recording of Kyle Lusk 95 23	
realtimereporters.net	24	
Page 2		Page 4
1 APPEARANCES:	1 OBJECTION INDEX	
2 APPEARING FOR THE PLAINTIFF:	2 BY MS. TULLY 13 BY MS. TULLY 13	
3	3 BY MS. TULLY 24	
John H. Bryan, Esquire 4 JOHN H. BRYAN, ATTORNEYS AT LAW	BY MS. TULLY 25	
411 Main Street	4 BY MS. TULLY 26 BY MS. TULLY 26	
5 P.O. Box 366	5 BY MS. TULLY 28	
Union, West Virginia 24983 6 jhb@johnbryanlaw.com	BY MS. TULLY 45 6 BY MS. TULLY 45	
7	BY MS. TULLY 51	
APPEARING FOR THE DEFENDANTS STUMP, MCPEAKE, AND 8 WHITE:	7 BY MS. TULLY 52	
9 Kevin J. Robinson, Esquire	BY MS. TULLY 53 8 BY MS. TULLY 53	
PULLIN, FOWLER, FLANAGAN, BROWN, 10 AND POE, PLLC	BY MS. TULLY 54	
252 George Street	9 BY MS. TULLY 54 BY MS. TULLY 54	
11 Beckley, West Virginia 25801 12	10 BY MS. TULLY 57	
APPEARING FOR THE DEFENDANT, LOUISE E. GOLDSTON:	BY MS. TULLY 58	
13	11 BY MS. TULLY 62 BY MS. TULLY 75	
Jennifer E. Tully, Esquire 14 BAILEY & WYANT, PLLC	12 BY MS. TULLY 76	
500 Virginia Street East, Suite 600	BY MS. TULLY 79 13 BY MR. ROBINSON 91	
15 P.O. Box 3710 Charleston, West Virginia 25337-3710	BY MS. TULLY 94	
16	14 BY MS. TULLY 96	
17 APPEARING FOR THE SUPREME COURT OF APPEALS OF WEST	BY MS. TULLY 98 15 BY MS. TULLY 99	
VIRGINIA: 18	BY MS. TULLY 100	
Bradley Schmalzer, Esquire (via telephone)	16 BY MS. TULLY 103 BY MS. TULLY 103	
Julianne Wisman, Esquire (via telephone)	17 103	
ALSO PRESENT:	18	
21 Bobby Stump, Defendant	19 20	
22 Matthew Gibson, Plaintiff	21	
J.R. Morgan 23	22	
24	23 24	

LOUISE GOLDSTON GIBSON V GOLDSTON

March 01, 2022 9-12

Page 11

Page 12

1 they used it.

- 2 A. They used it. I disagree with it.
- 3 Q. The Supreme Court found that you led a
- 4 search of the homeowner's residence, not a judicial
- 5 view.
- 6 A. That's what they found.
- 7 Q. The West Virginia Supreme Court further
- 8 found that in so doing, that you "exercised
- 9 executive powers forbidden to you under the West
- 10 Virginia Constitution". Is that true?
- 11 A. That is what they found.
- 12 Q. Okay. Do you disagree with that?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. The Court further held in that Opinion that
- 15 you did not go to the property to observe the
- 16 ex-husband's house but that you went there to
- 17 locate and seize certain of its contents:
- 18 Pictures, DVDs, and other items of personal
- 19 property. Is that true?
- 20 A. That is true.
- 21 Q. Do you disagree with the Supreme Court's
- 22 holding?
- 23 A. Which holding?
- 24 Q. That you went to the house to locate and

- Page 9 1 Court found but you disagree.
 - 2 A. I think I've already answered that but yes.
 - 3 I did not go there to locate them. I went there to
 - 4 allow Mrs. Gibson to retrieve the items she had
 - 5 been awarded.
 - 6 Q. Did you --
 - 7 A. And Mister -- and only the items that
 - 8 Mr. Gibson had previously testified were still
 - 9 there.
 - 10 Q. Okay. But you -- you didn't know where
 - 11 they were inside his house, did you?
 - 12 A. I did not, and I did not look.
 - 13 Q. So they -- somebody had to locate them
 - 14 inside the house.
 - 15 A. That's correct.
 - 16 Q. Okay. And nobody asked Mr. Gibson to go in
 - 17 his house and bring the items outside.
 - 18 A. No.
 - 19 Q. You went in, right?
 - 20 A. I did.
 - 21 Q. And the bailiff -- your bailiff went in.
 - 22 A. He did.
 - 23 Q. Mrs. Gibson went in.
 - 24 A. She did.

Page 10

- 1 seize certain contents personal property in the
- 2 house.
- 3 A. I disagree that I went there personally to
- 4 locate them. I do agree that I went there to seize
- 5 them.
- 6 Q. And why do you -- why do you disagree that
- 7 you went there to locate them?
- 8 A. Because, as is clear on the tape taken by
- 9 Officer McPeake, I did not look for nor try to
- 10 locate anything. I asked Mrs. Gibson where those
- 11 items that she was not given, as awarded in the
- 12 order -- where they were located when she lived
- 13 there. I told her to look there. She asked to
- 14 look other places. I denied that request.
- 15 So I did not attempt to locate anything.
- 16 The things that she was awarded that were in the
- 17 same place that they'd been when the couple lived
- 18 there together, I allowed her to take.
- 19 Q. However, the Supreme Court stated that "the
- 20 record is clear that Judge Goldston went to the
- 21 property to locate things, not simply to observe
- 22 them." Right?
- 23 A. That is what they found.
- 24 Q. Okay. That's -- that's what the Supreme

- Q. And Mr. Lusk went in.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. To locate the items.
- 4 A. Yes. I would say retrieve the items but --
- 5 Q. In fact, the Supreme Court noted in their
- 6 Opinion that when Mr. Gibson demanded a list of
- 7 what you were seeking, you replied, "You have a
- 8 list of everything attached to the order."
- 9 And when he professed not to know where
- 10 some of it's at, you replied, "Well, we're going to
- 11 find it."
- 12 A. I did.
- 13 Q. Okay. So as the Supreme Court noted, you
- 14 told Mr. Gibson that you would be going inside his
- 15 house to find items.
- 16 A. Correct.
- 17 Q. But you disagree with the categorization of
- 18 that is a search.
- 19 A. That that is a search by me, yes.
- 20 Q. You would admit that it's a search by
- 21 somebody.
- 22 A. Again, I told Mrs. Gibson she could look
- 23 only in places where the items she had been awarded
- 24 were located and that if they were not there she

Page 17

LOUISE GOLDSTON GIBSON V GOLDSTON

March 01, 2022 17–20

Page 20

1 others inside his house. Is that true?

2 A. Can you show me where that is?

3 MS. TULLY: Where does it say that?

4 THE DEPONENT: Right here.

5 A. I would agree that he probably felt he had

6 no choice, unless he wanted to be arrested.

Q. Also referring to Page 4, the Court noted

8 that you brought with you into Mr. Gibson's house

9 "the ex-wife, the ex-wife's attorney, and

10 personally supervised the search for and recovery

11 of items." Is that true?

12 A. That's true what they said. Again, I

13 disagree with the word "search".

14 Q. Also on Page 4, the Court noted that:

15 "Several items were located and recovered,

16 including photographs, yearbooks, DVDs, recipes,

17 and a chainsaw." Is that true?

18 A. That's correct.

19 Q. And the Court noted that you "made no

20 arrangements to record what went on inside the home

21 or outside the home." Is that true?

22 A. That is true. Can I speak to that?

23 Q. Sure.

24 A. The Supreme Court talks about, in this

Page 19
A. Yes and no. There have been times when

2 repairs or renovations to courtrooms were being

3 made and I had them in jury rooms or conference

4 rooms or that kind of thing. Those all occurred

5 prior to my recording things on -- by video and

6 then recording. Those were back in the days when I

7 did it on cassette tape.

8 Q. In fact, the Court noted in the Opinion

9 that your bailiff had made his own cellphone

10 recording inside Mr. Gibson's home.

11 A. That's correct.

12 Q. Were you aware of that at the time that

13 Deputy McPeake was filming with his cellphone?

14 A. No.

15 Q. When did you first find out about that?

16 A. When I got back to the office, he sent it

17 to me on my phone.

18 Q. So he provided that directly to you?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. So when he testified that he did not

21 provide that directly to you, that was incorrect?

22 A. He was mistaken.

23 Q. And when he sent you that video, what did

24 you do?

Page 18

1 Opinion, that I did not take a court reporter with

2 me. I do not have a court reporter. That's why it

3 has always been my practice, and Rule 8 of the West

4 Virginia Rules of Practice and Procedure for Family

5 Courts specifically states that I am the only one

6 who has the authority to film that -- to record

7 those proceedings.

8 So that -- that is why when we returned to

9 the home -- to the courtroom, I made every effort

10 to set forth everything that happened at the house

11 and gave both Mr. Gibson and Mr. Lusk an

12 opportunity to add to, detract from, or correct

13 anything that I said that had happened at the

14 scene.

15 But I have no way to record those

16 proceedings.

17 Q. How do you usually record proceedings?

18 A. With a computer.

19 Q. And that takes place in your courtroom?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Other than these so-called visits over the

22 course of your 20 years as a family court judge,

23 did you ever have proceedings anywhere else, other

24 than the courtroom or inside a litigant's home?

A. I sent it immediately to my case

2 coordinator and I deleted it from my phone.

3 Q. But you never realized, at the time at

4 Mr. Gibson's house, that Deputy McPeake was

5 recording?

6 A. No.

7 Q. And you didn't ask him to record at the

8 house?

9 A. No.

10 Q. Had he been with you on prior visits to

11 litigants' homes?

12 A. No.

13 Q. So that was the first for McPeake?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. So the Supreme Court Opinion was accurate

16 when it stated that you believed that McPeake

17 "making the recording was improper and that you

18 told him not to do it again"?

19 A. Yes. I have since reviewed Rule 8 and do

20 now realize that I have the authority to authorize

21 somebody to record it but I did not realize that at 22 the time.

23 Q. Do you still believe that Rule 8, or any

24 other rule, authorizes you told proceedings in the

Page 57

LOUISE GOLDSTON GIBSON V GOLDSTON

March 01, 2022 57-60

1 voluntary?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. And what was your answer --

4 A. Yes.

5 Q. -- during that hearing?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Okay. Do you recall whether that testimony

8 was taken under oath?

A. To my knowledge, it was. Yes. 9

10 Q. And was your testimony truthful that day?

11 A. Yes.

12 MS. TULLY: She's not denied that this

13 is her signature on the agreement.

15 that -- she says she was coerced and she testified

MR. BRYAN: Right. But she's denied

16 during that hearing that she voluntarily entered

17 that agreement, knowingly.

18 A. With the knowledge that I had at the time,

19 yes.

14

20 BY MR. BRYAN:

21 Q. Okay. So at the time you entered the

22 agreement, you did so knowingly, voluntarily, and

23 intelligently, right?

1 answered.

24 MS. TULLY: Objection. Asked and

Page 59 1 the house, in that we were talking about stuff that

2 he testified under oath were still at the house.

3 But if I had to do it again, I would say,

"We are going to your house to get those items."

5 And, quite frankly, I would have made it

6 more clear to him that I was not doing it

punitively to him, but I did not want to put

8 Mr. Gibson in jail for not returning those items.

He's a corrections officer. I did not

10 think he would be treated well if he went to jail,

11 and in my mind, if we could just go get those items

12 that he admitted were there, that he admitted she

13 was awarded, then that would solve everybody's

14 problem.

15 He would not be able to say that Ms. Gibson

16 destroyed the items after she got them. Ms. Gibson

17 would not then be able to say that he destroyed or

18 he damaged the items after we retrieved them. It

19 was the -- in my mind, it was the fairest, most

20 efficient way to resolve the case.

21 Q. So what was your mistake?

22 A. Not setting forth that clearly on the

23 record.

24 Q. Is that it?

Page 58

Page 60

Q. But later changed your mind.

3 A. I didn't change my mind. I learned more

4 about the law and realized that some of those

5 canons I do not believe were violated.

Q. Of course, the Supreme Court rejected your 6 7 --

8 MS. TULLY: Objection.

9 Q. -- your belief, right?

10 A. Obviously.

11 Q. Okay. So rather than saying you were

12 coerced, wouldn't it be more accurate to say that

13 you had regret?

A. I think it would be more accurate to say

15 that I think I made a mistake.

Q. As we sit here today, do you believe that

17 you made any mistakes on March 4th, 2020 when you

18 visited Mr. Gibson's home?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And what -- what mistakes did you make?

21 A. One mistake I think I made was I should

22 have informed Mr. Gibson before we left, while we

23 were going to his house. I could not imagine at

24 the time that he did not know why we were going to

A. My mistake? That's all I can think of. I

2 think -- well, I'm not going to volunteer.

Q. No, that's okay. What? 3

4 A. I think if I'd had a more experienced

5 bailiff -- I can think of another mistake I made.

6 If I'd had a more experienced bailiff that had done

7 this with me before, that that bailiff would not

8 have called for backup.

9 I had not known Deputy McPeake had called

10 for backup. I knew he had said something on the

11 radio. I always kind of assume they're saying

12 they're out of their vehicle or whatever.

13 The other mistake I made was when I arrived

14 there -- and I'm not saying he did it intentionally

15 but Mr. Gibson immediately came toward me, making

16 his motions, which he certainly was entitled to do

17 but it rattled me a little bit and I did not notice

18 all the other cars that were there.

19 And had I had the chance to get my

20 bearings, I would've had all those cars leave and

21 all those people leave because, as you know, Family

22 Court hearings are confidential, no one is allowed

23 in the hearing except the parties and any

24 witnesses. None of those other people had been

LOUISE GOLDSTON GIBSON V GOLDSTON

March 01, 2022 61-64

Page 63

Page 64

1 called as witnesses.

- 2 I did tell Ms. Gibson as we were leaving,
- 3 if she had a vehicle that she did not believe she
- 4 could fit the items that Mr. Gibson had admitted
- 5 were there that her father could come for the sole
- 6 purpose of hauling the items, but I would've
- 7 immediately had my bailiff clear out all the other
- 8 people because my experience is the more people you
- 9 have there, the more dangerous and out of hand it
- 10 can get.
- 11 But I did not do that because I was
- 12 immediately confronted with all these other
- 13 motions, which I was happy to rule on but it did
- 14 not give me the time I needed to assess the
- 15 situation and do the safety things I normally -- or
- 16 my bailiff normally would have done.
- 17 Q. You would agree with me that your physical
- 18 safety was never in jeopardy at any point at
- 19 Mr. Gibson's house.
- 20 A. I did not feel threatened. No. But as far
- 21 as speculating what could've happened, I don't
- 22 know.
- 23 Q. Okay. Mr. Gibson never threatened you in
- 24 any way, did he?

Page 61

1 am sure can be perceived as a threat.

- Q. And had you ordered the arrest of
- 3 Mr. Gibson, it would've been Deputy McPeake that
- 4 made the arrest, right?
- 5 A. I assume so, yes.
- Q. And, in fact, you wanted to make sure that
- 7 bailiffs who traveled with you to the home -- homes
- 8 of litigants had arrest powers.
- 9 A. That's a misstatement. When I asked --
- 10 because Deputy McPeake is a retired bailiff and
- 11 came in under this statute, they had been supplying
- 12 me with officers who were not certified.
- 13 I asked -- one of my requirements, as I am
- 14 entitled under the code, is to have a deputy with
- 15 arrest powers. I have never arrested anybody at a
- 16 scene. I have had people arrested in the courtroom
- 17 or outside the courtroom for direct contempt of
- 18 court. So I wanted a bailiff that if the courtroom
- 19 got out of control, that person could effect an
- 20 arrest. The two requests were not related.
- 21 Q. At some point in Mr. Gibson's front yard,
- 22 did you threaten to arrest any other third party,
- 23 other than Mr. Gibson?
- 24 A. Not to my memory, and I know what you're

Page 62

- A. No. As I said, he approached me guickly
- 2 when I got out of the vehicle and that rattled me.
- 3 Did it scare me? No.
- 4 Q. And, to the contrary, you threatened
- 5 Mr. Gibson with arrest, even though you knew he was
- 6 a federal correctional officer.
- 7 MS. TULLY: Object to form.
- 8 A. Again, I did not just threaten him with
- 9 arrest. I told him that I was instructing him to
- 10 let us in the house so that we could retrieve the
- 11 items and that that was an order of the Court. If
- 12 he refused to do that, he would be held in contempt
- 13 and one of the remedies for direct contempt of a
- 14 court order is arrest.
- 15 Q. And Deputy McPeake was present as your
- 16 bailiff when you made these statements to
- 17 Mr. Gibson.
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 Q. Okay. And you were here when he testified
- 20 a few days ago during his deposition.
- 21 A. I was.
- 22 Q. Okay. And I believe that he testified that
- 23 he heard you threaten to arrest Mr. Gibson.
- 24 A. I just said that I -- what I said, which I

- 1 talking about. Mr. Lusk pointed out to me that
- 2 Mister -- and I didn't know she was his girlfriend
- 3 -- that there was a woman at the top of the
- 4 driveway recording.
- 5 My memory is I said, "Stop recording.
- 6 You're not allowed to record."
- 7 I do not believe I threatened to arrest
- 8 her.
- 9 Q. She was at the top of Mr. Gibson's
- 10 driveway.
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 Q. And you're aware that that was somebody who
- 13 was with Mr. Gibson.
- 14 A. I assume so. I had never laid eyes on her
- 15 before.
- 16 Q. All right. Let me play some audio.
- 17 MR. BRYAN: Which I have some
- 18 electronic exhibits on this thumb drive and I'll
- 19 provide that to the court reporter.
- 20 MS. TULLY: Okay.
- 21 Q. I think this would be Exhibit 6. If I
- 22 click the right button here, this would be, I
- 23 believe, the audio recorded by Mr. Gibson
- 24 personally.